A BRIEF ACCOUNT OF PROJECT ACTIVITIES IN SYRIA
The Aga Khan Trust for Culture (AKTC) conducts a number of programmes, including the Historic Cities Support Programme, the Aga Khan Award for Architecture and the Education and Culture Programme. The Historic Cities Support Programme (HCSP) was established in 1992 to actively promote the conservation and re-use of buildings and public spaces in historic cities in the Islamic world. Its objective is to undertake the restoration and rehabilitation of historic structures and public spaces in ways that can spur social, economic and cultural development. Individual project briefs thus go beyond mere technical restoration to address the questions of social and environmental context, adaptive re-use, community participation, institutional sustainability and training. In several countries, local Aga Khan Cultural Service Companies have been formed to implement projects under the supervision of the HCSP headquarters in Geneva.

To date, the Historic Cities Support Programme has pursued revitalisation projects in six quite different settings in the Islamic world, i.e., the Northern Areas of Pakistan, Zanzibar, Samarkand, Cairo, Mostar (Bosnia) and Syria, including nearly twenty distinct but interconnected projects which often are mutually reinforcing. Initial involvement in a single project in a particular location or region has the potential to expand, in order to constitute a critical mass for positive change, if the environment is found to be responsive. In all project locations, community participation, training of local professionals and local institution-building are essential components. Many other institutions,
such as the Getty Grant Program, World Monuments Fund, the Ford Foundation, the Swiss, Swedish and Norwegian bilateral aid organisations and The World Bank have sponsored or co-funded HCSP activities.

The Trust’s involvement in Syria is the most recent HCSP initiative. It stems from a request from the Syrian Antiquities Department, in late 1999, to provide technical assistance on the conservation and re-use of a number of historic citadels in the country. The main aspects to be considered for each site were training of the local Antiquities staff in up-to-date conservation techniques, providing guidance on proper environmental protection and management of complete sites, creating visitor routes of touristic interest in neglected areas (which would thus receive new economic stimulation) as well as establishing documentation and guide books for visitors.

The project started with a thorough survey of various citadel sites all over Syria. Evaluation of various criteria, such as architectural remains, site potential, accessibility and urgency of intervention, led to the selection of three sites, i.e., the Citadel of Salah ed Din near Lattakia, the Citadel of Aleppo and the Citadel of Masyaf – a decision taken jointly with the Syrian Antiquities Department. At each site a two-track approach was taken. In response to the specific request of the Antiquities Department, certain urgent conservation works were tackled immediately. At the same time, the team engaged in more comprehensive surveys and studies, some of which are still under way. The following is intended to provide an update on the current state of work which is being undertaken in close cooperation with the Syrian Antiquities Department.
The Citadel of Salah Ed-Din
The Citadel of Salah ed-Din is located high in the coastal mountain range, some 24 kilometres east of Lattakia. On a fine day one can see the Mediterranean sparkling in the far distance. Its natural setting is spectacular, resting high on a ridge between two deep ravines, and surrounded by forest. Like many sites in Syria, the history of occupation on the site has gone through many phases, reaching back possibly to the Phoenician period (early first millennium BC). Much of what remains visible today dates from the Crusaders, who occupied the site around 1100 AD. They were responsible for constructing the high stone walls and defensive towers, and cutting a deep moat into the rocks. In the middle of the moat rises a thin needle of remaining natural rock, 28 metres high, on which rested a bridge, once the only entry into the Citadel. The Crusader walls were breached by the armies of Salah ed-Din in July 1188, and it is from this victory that the castle takes its present name. Over the next hundred years, the new Muslim rulers built a mosque and a fine palace and baths at the heart of the castle complex. Later, a madrasa was also constructed. It is these Ayyubid and Mamluk sections of the Citadel that AKTC has selected for its conservation efforts over the past two years.

Conservation work began in 1999 with an extensive survey of the site. This was followed in 2000 by the restoration of the mosque and its minaret and the adjacent madrasa. The minaret posed particular problems: an earthquake had broken the top of the minaret apart, causing it to partially collapse, and many loose stones in the top section were in danger of falling. The team painstakingly recorded the position of each stone, and then slowly took the top apart, not an inconsiderable feat given the size and weight of the stones. The top of the minaret was then re-built using the original stones and knitting-in other stones found around the site to form a stable and durable structure. Different problems were tackled in the madrasa and mosque. Both buildings were structurally stable, but successive phases of modern repairs using inappropriate materials had altered and damaged the historic fabric. Where feasible, the modern interventions were carefully removed, and walls, ceilings and roofs were then repaired and finished using materials and techniques identical to those employed by the original mediaeval craftsmen, making the buildings sound without detracting from their historic character. The restoration process was successfully completed in the autumn of 2000.

During 2001, the team has been working on the conservation of the remains of the Ayyubid palace and baths. The palace complex was built in at least two phases between 1188 and 1290. The superstructure of the main qa’a, or inner courtyard at the core of the Palace, is almost gone, although the remains of an octagonal fountain can still be clearly seen at its centre. The
qa’a is surrounded on one side by the ruins of a small bath and on the other by a series of more intact private rooms. In both sets of adjoining spaces, archaeologists working with the project have uncovered the remains of a sophisticated piped water system, which probably fed a salsabil (a carved stone or ceramic panel set against the wall over which flowed fresh water, cooling the air and the senses) as well as the fountain and the hot and cold water systems in the bath. The entrance to the palace is still largely intact, and consists of another smaller qa’a with two shallow iwans and a skylight made of finely carved stones. Perhaps the most interesting aspect of the complex is the entrance portico with its fine muqarnas, or stalactite carvings. Over the years, movement in the structure has prised open the joints between the massive stones that make up the portico, but rather than detract from it, the gaps provide a glimpse of the extraordinary skill and geometrical precision of the craftsmen who built it.

Conservation work in the palace and baths do not attempt to restore or reconstruct earlier hypothetical conditions. Ruins have been carefully stabilised as found, and only rebuilt where required to gain structural stability. The French architect and archaeologist Ecochard carried out extensive restoration of the entrance area in the 1930’s, and whilst this work is in spirit very different from the less interventionist approach of today, it has been respected as an integral part of the historic texture of the site. Much of the wall surfaces in the entrance area were weathered and defaced with graffiti and these have been carefully cleaned and re-pointed. Work at the palace was preceded by a detailed archaeological survey of the ruins carried out by a team from the Sorbonne University in Paris. The first findings are encouraging and indicate that it will be possible to gain a better idea of the structure of the entire complex. Important pottery fragments from the twelfth century were found and will be exhibited on site.
The Citadel of Salah ed-Din is already an important destination for tourism in Syria; during last year, over 50,000 people visited the site. The project at Salah ed Din will also include the provision of a new visitors’ centre and exhibition space in the restored mosque and madrasa buildings, and AKTC will invest in other aspects of tourism infrastructure at the site such as toilet facilities, signage and pathways for visitors.

Particular attention is now being given to one of the major attractions of the site, the untouched surroundings of the Citadel which need to be preserved. Master planning for the Citadel as a whole and for the pristine landscape surrounding the Citadel (to be protected as a nature preserve) have been initiated and will continue in the following years. Plans for new roads, hotels on critical view points and more visitors’ facilities will have to be carefully scrutinised and controlled, in order to maintain the wilderness in which the Citadel has been historically set.

---

*Above left:* The minaret stands in front of the mosque and madrasa. To their right is the entrance portico of the Ayyubid palace behind which are a series of rooms and open spaces. Conservation efforts sponsored by HCSP have been focused on these Ayyubid and Mamluk sections of the Citadel.

*Above top:* Detail of the entrance portico of the Ayyubid palace with its fine ‘muquarnas’ or stalactite carvings.

*Above middle:* One of the massive Crusader donjons on the outer wall of the Citadel.

*Above bottom:* The fosse, or defensive ditch, carved out of bedrock, 28 metres deep. In the centre is a thin needle of natural rock upon which rested the bridge access to the Citadel. When under attack, the flimsy stone support for the bridge atop the needle would be pushed away leaving the main entrance unreachable.

“It was I think the most sensational thing in castle building I have seen: the hugely solid keep upstanding on the edge of the gigantic fosse.”

T. E. Lawrence
The minaret: An earthquake had broken the top of the minaret apart. To ensure structural stability, the top section was carefully taken apart and largely rebuilt, using new stones where the original were beyond repair. The size and weight of the stones needed to rebuild made the conservation process particularly difficult.

The madrasa: This part is more recent than the mosque or minaret. The space was formed by filling-in between several vaults of the former palace. All the plasterwork inside the madrasa was badly damaged and had to be replaced using materials and techniques similar to those employed by the mediaeval craftsmen.

The entrance to the mosque and madrasa: Great effort was put into preserving the historic character of the site. The mosque and madrasa will be reused for a small exhibition telling the history of the castle and its famous namesake, Salah ed-Din (Saladin).
During 2001, conservation efforts have focused on the Ayyubid palace. The superstructure of the main qa’a, or inner courtyard, has largely disappeared (above left), although the remains of an octagonal pool can be seen at its centre. The entrance to the palace is largely intact, and consists of a portico (previous page) and a smaller interior qa’a (above right) with a skylight of carved stones.

Elevation drawing of the north side of the minaret showing completed work.

Plan of the mosque, minaret and madrasa
The Citadel of Aleppo
The Citadel of Aleppo

The Citadel of Aleppo is a far more complex site, standing as it does at the centre of the old city of Aleppo, which was recognised as a World Heritage Site by UNESCO in 1986. The earliest levels of occupation found at the Citadel go as far back as the sixteenth century BC, although it is likely that the site was first occupied even earlier. Most of what remains standing today was built by the Ayyubid (12th to 13th centuries) and Mamluk (13th to 15th centuries) rulers of the city who used the site for both military and ceremonial purposes. The citadel is built on top of a natural limestone tell rising some 50 metres above the level of the surrounding city. Its high walls, imposing entry bridge and great gateway remain largely intact, and continue to dominate the skyline of the city, a powerful symbol of the city’s heroic past. Inside the walls, a succession of invasions, bombardments and earthquakes have taken their toll, but amongst the ruins stand two fine mosques, a hammam and the remains of a palace – all dating from the Ayyubid period. The former Mamluk throne room built in 1400 on top of the entrance gate was sympathetically reconstructed in the late seventies. The display of craftsmanship is lavish but lacks authentic character.

In 2000, the Trust initiated a pilot restoration project on one of the towers in the curtain wall, again applying up-to-date and internationally recognised conservation procedures. The inner wall of the tower had collapsed and only a thin outer membrane of stones kept the structure from collapsing entirely. The team stabilised the remaining wall, and then rebuilt the inner walls and arches, carefully matching the new stones and finish to the original phases of construction. This process was successfully completed at the end of 2000. During 2001, the Trust commenced work on a larger section of the curtain wall adjacent to the tower. From a distance, the wall appears massive and is the defining feature of the Citadel. On closer inspection, however, it is more severely damaged than it appears from outside. The process of decay continues unabated, and where the looser inner-core of the wall is exposed, it continues to be eroded by the elements. Conservation work on the wall included stabilising ruined sections and consolidating areas where it had become structurally unsound. The project Team has collaborated with the Directorate of Antiquities to excavate an area of the Citadel crown beside the wall revealing the remains of the last phase of occupation on the site in the Ottoman period.

The project will go on to identify and develop further physical conservation projects in other parts of the Citadel for work starting in 2002. These will include the conservation of what remains of the Ayyubid palace, with its fine muqarnas in the entrance portal and original marble pattern flooring. The rooms behind the palace, the so-called arsenal will also be cleaned,
The Citadel is built upon a natural limestone hill rising 50 metres above the surrounding city. Its walls and great gateway (top right and left) dominate the skyline of the historic city. A dry ditch surrounds the Citadel, spanned by an entry bridge.

consolidated and integrated into visitors’ circuits. In addition, plans are now being prepared for re-locating the objects of the current Citadel museum in terms of thematic exhibits in the arsenal and elsewhere on the Citadel. This will free up the Ottoman barracks building for re-use as a more attractive visitors’ facility. Situated on the highest location of the site and at the edge of the northern enclosure, this building offers excellent opportunities for a visitors’ centre and can be combined with shaded terraces overlooking the site and the city. Apart from conservation and re-use, particular attention will also be given to the erosion on the citadel slope, and possibilities for improved drainage.

The Citadel of Aleppo is one of Syria’s foremost monuments. In 1999, it received just under 300,000 visitors, 90,000 of whom were foreigners from outside the Middle East. However, guidance and facilities for visitors appropriate to the site are still missing. A strategic plan determining the
sequence and priorities of further restoration works as well as guidelines for future re-use and site management has been initiated in 2001, with the help of a recently established committee of experienced researchers, historians and architects, under the overall supervision of H.E. the Prime Minister of Syria, Dr Mohamed Mustafa Miro. Together with the planned improvement of visitors’ facilities, a guidebook describing the history of the place along specific visiting circuits is being prepared.

In parallel with the “interior” plan for the Citadel, a master plan for the urban fabric around it is being developed. This plan will assess and evaluate development opportunities around the Citadel, define land use and building regulations, and help control future pressures resulting from increased tourism. In particular, it will aim at enhancing the future pedestrian (or low-traffic) zones around the moat of the Citadel, at controlling and reducing vehicular traffic, and providing both car parking and public transportation facilities.

Inside the Citadel walls, earthquakes and bombardments have taken their toll. Some important elements have survived, including part of the Ayyubid palace (built in 1230 and destroyed by the Mongols in 1400) with its fine muqarnas and patterned stonework in the entrance portico (top left, middle ground) and marble patterned floor in the main qa’a. There are also two mosques within the Citadel (top right) and an hammam. The original Throne Room (above) was built by the Mamluk rulers of the city after the last Mongol invasion of 1400, and was comprehensively rebuilt in the 1970’s.

Left: Photographs of the Citadel and the surrounding city, taken by the eminent French architect and archaeologist Ecochard in the 1930’s.
Conservation work at the Citadel funded by AKTC commenced in 2000 on a section of the curtain wall on the western side. Although the wall appears sound from outside, manmade and natural forces have seriously undermined it.

During 2000, conservation work focused on the flanking tower, a small vaulted space on the west wall (above left and middle). The inner layer of stonework had collapsed, and was entirely rebuilt. In 2002, HCSP will begin conservation work on the marble floor of the Ayyubid palace.
The slope of the limestone hill upon which the Citadel is built was made steeper by the mediaeval builders. Deep gullies have been cut into the slope by rainwater runoff, and in places these are threatening the stability of the wall.
The Citadel of Masyaf
The Citadel of Masyaf

The Citadel of Masyaf is the smallest and least well-known of the three sites. It lies on the edge of the old town of Masyaf, which has grown considerably over the past thirty years, in a dramatic natural setting at the foot of the coastal mountains. Like the other sites, the history of occupation at Masyaf stretches back through many phases, but it is chiefly known as the stronghold of the Ismailis under the leadership of their ruler Sinan, in the twelfth century. Much of what remains today dates from this period of occupation.

The castle’s superstructure is largely intact although now crumbling, damaged by armed assault and earthquakes, and within living memory, several generations of townspeople who used it as their home and a place to tether goats. From time to time, old men wander up to reminisce about a childhood spent amongst the battlements. In places, the original plaster still clings to the walls, bearing inscriptions or rough decorative patterns, and massive basalt lintels support door openings. Like many structures in Syria, building materials from earlier phases of construction have been recycled, sometimes with surprising results: a beautifully carved Corinthian capital, almost certainly dating from the Byzantine period props up one wall in the entrance-way. The castle is not as elegant or refined as Aleppo, but matches the mountains around in its rugged beauty.

The first builders on the site took advantage of a natural limestone hill rising above the surrounding plain and village. Successive occupants added layers to the structure, and exploited the natural crevices and hollows in the limestone bedrock to create a series of subterranean passages and chambers. Water management was a crucial aspect of defence in the seasonally arid mountains and three enormous cisterns were hewn out of the rock and connected to the surface by an intricate system of ceramic water pipes. At the centre of the castle, on the highest level, is Sinan’s Throne Room, from where, according to local legend, the Old Man of the Mountain ruled. Whether or not this legend has any basis in fact is disputed, but the room is certainly an eyrie, perched above the town and the plane beyond.

Conservation work at the Citadel began in 2000 on a section of the outer wall, which had partially collapsed. Part of the wall had to be rebuilt to make it structurally sound, using stones identical to the original taken from a quarry nearby. Despite considerable technical problems, this restoration work was completed in the autumn of 2000. A more comprehensive consolidation and restoration programme for the entire structure, developed in close consultation with the Directorate of Antiquities, commenced in early 2001. The objective of this programme is to maintain the basic integrity.
of the site as a ruin whilst assisting visitors to gain as much from a visit as possible. In physical terms, the intervention will be limited to strict conservation, i.e., consolidating ruins to arrest the process of deterioration, and where necessary, minor reconstruction to avert the threat of collapse. Visitors will be provided with a minimum infrastructure to guide them around the site, including signage, information panels, lighting and improved access. A new guidebook on the history of Masyaf is also being prepared. It is hoped that the project will be completed over the next two to three years.

In addition to conservation of the castle, the project envisages an improvement of its urban context, with a view to conserving and enhancing the historic remains of the adjacent old city of Masyaf, upgrading the markets and pedestrian areas in the old city centre, and creating more attractive facilities for visitors. Support is also provided to the municipality offices, in terms of improving current building regulations. This effort is underpinned by granting free design assistance to land owners and house owners who

The builders of the Citadel took advantage of the natural crevices in the rock to create subterranean passages. The photograph top right shows the curtain wall on the east side before conservation work began (note area of collapse in the centre). Opposite page, top left, is a close up of same section of wall after repairs were completed.

Rebuilding of the eastern wall.
intend to build in the central area. A number of pilot rehabilitation projects for sensitive buildings have been prepared and should hopefully succeed in promoting a new, adapted design vocabulary in the inner city. Public awareness about urban design issues, as well as greater community involvement, has been fostered by a series of public meetings and the formation of civic interest groups.

In addition, a strategic urban-planning concept has been developed in order to resolve anticipated land-use conflicts around the Citadel and to preserve the Citadel’s visual dominance, a major asset for the economic future of the city. Ongoing detail studies imply: i) a revision of the current master plan, to retain a sufficient zone non aedificandi on the valley side of the fort (and thus preserve its visual impact), ii) detailed urban design and building regulations for the former walled city abutting the fort, and iii) a number of upgrading and improvement projects to enhance the urban surroundings of the fort, and make them more attractive to visitors and tourists.

Apart from urgent conservation works, AKTC will fund basic visitors facilities, including improved access through the site (paths, stairs, etc.), lighting, signage and a small exhibition describing its history.
Proposal for a revised master plan now being discussed with the Syrian Authorities. The intention is to pedestrianise the old city, improve transportation flows around the historic nucleus and maintain a certain number of protected open spaces on the eastern side of the Citadel, to preserve its traditional visual quality.
The main streets and the suqs in the historic nucleus of Masyaf are in urgent need of conservation and rehabilitation. Plot-by-plot studies for important street elevations are being carried out, and important historic houses have been recorded as reference for an adapted “design vocabulary”.
Of many historic buildings only the ground floors with the shop arcades have survived. Urban design concepts are being developed to help land owners implement appropriate restoration and infill projects, instead of proceeding with demolition and replacement. In cooperation with the local shopkeepers, a renewal project for the central suq has been worked out, to be implemented on a participatory basis.

(Perspective top right)
Emerging Strategic Issues
For many years, tourism has been a neglected aspect of development in Syria, and perhaps not to the disadvantage of many surviving sites. Today, however, the issue of how to capitalise on tourism is emerging forcefully in the contemporary national debate. This, obviously, raises the question how to reconcile conservation objectives with the search for economic benefits derived from tourism. As is well known from many sites all over the world, a misguided type of mass tourism is capable of eventually destroying the very resources on which it is based – only to move elsewhere, to other, yet unspoilt sites. How to keep the “goose that lays the golden egg” alive is the key issue in dealing with such sensitive sites.

In this situation, it is important to strike a correct balance between conservation and tourism, and to ensure that conservation becomes an integral part of any development scheme in areas with cultural potential. Often, the problem is that development proceeds without any clear goals, let alone guidance. Culturally sensitive areas, in particular, should not be allowed to undergo haphazard or speculative development, but need to be carefully planned with a comprehensive and integrated vision in mind. Conservation of historic or natural sites and monuments can become an important factor in the country’s economic development, but such development has to be managed in ways which preserve the inherited assets and make tourism sustainable.

During the preparation and implementation of the three Citadel projects, a number of critical issues have come up which are discussed below. While these issues always need to be resolved on site, case by case, they nevertheless imply certain policy decisions, on which a consensus needs to be developed.

- **Reconstruction versus Conservation:** In many places around the world, it is thought that imaginative reconstructions of missing parts increase the appeal of a building to visitors. This, however, threatens the authenticity of historic sites. In the Trust’s projects, reconstruction of missing elements was replaced by proper documentation, consolidation and conservation of existing features. Some exceptions were made in cases where clear evidence existed, matching materials and techniques were available and structural benefits could be derived from reconstruction. Instead, “virtual” reconstruction by three-dimensional models or computer simulations will be offered to visitors, whenever archaeological and historic research provides sufficient information, as part of specially designed presentations within or near the site.
Archaeological Works versus Site Management: Sweeping archaeological investigation can be a temptation on many sites. But archaeological works need proper scientific objectives and documentation and should not permanently conflict with the potential of the site for visitors. Therefore, they have to be limited to restricted areas, and be carried out one at a time. Indiscriminate large-scale excavations without clear scope and proper documentation should be discouraged in the interest of both the monument and the visitors. Excavations which yielded historic evidence, but no remains to be presented on a permanent basis, should be refilled, while presentable features should be properly conserved.

Creation of Protected Areas of National Interest around Historic Sites: While tourism is still underdeveloped in Syria, the dangers of haphazard commercial development related to tourism (roads, hotels, guesthouses, restaurants, visitor centres) need to be anticipated and
controlled, particularly in pristine areas which can become natural parks. Local institutions do not have sufficient authority or resources to achieve this on their own and need support from national legislation relating to what could be defined as “Cultural and Natural Sanctuaries”. Together with such a legal framework, more stringent practical rules and guidelines need to be developed, as well as specific land-use plans and appropriate design concepts for the domain of specific monuments.

- **Coordination with Urban Development Plans and Land-Use Policies around Landmark Buildings in Urban Surroundings**: Fragmentation of administrative responsibility often allows master plans and development plans to be conceived and sanctioned without any reference to cultural heritage (or precious natural resources) contained in the area. Under the umbrella of national legislation for particular historic sites, the various governmental departments would need to cooperate towards achieving integrated development plans, where cultural assets are safeguarded and properly exploited. Special national and local expertise needs to be developed in this regard.

- **Promoting Financial Self-Sustainability**: The development component involved in the site management of specific monuments should generate at least part of the income needed to maintain the structures themselves. This is only possible if revenues derived from developed sites (as well as fringe-benefits generated by tourism) are reinvested in the same location or project, instead of being treated as general revenue by central government, or being captured by speculative developers. Recycling local revenues in explicit and visible manner will also boost local commitment and encourage communities to take responsibility for their cultural sites.

Over the coming years, the joint projects of AKTC and the Syrian Antiquities Department will continue to deal with these strategic issues in a pragmatic way, hoping that the various solutions developed within and around the three above-mentioned sites will raise the necessary awareness and can serve as pilot projects which may also benefit other important locations in Syria.

**Credits:**
This brochure was written by Stefano Bianca and Stephen Battle, photographs by Garry Otte, Jean-Luc Ray, Ratish Nanda, Fleming Aalund, Marco A. Marelli, Thierry Grandin, Khaldoun Fansa, Tony Steel, Stephen Battle and Stefano Bianca. Plans and drawings by Masood Khan and Thierry Grandin, consultants.